# Mind-Reach 

Scientists Look at Psychic Ability. By Russell Targ and Harold Puthoff. 230 pp . New York:
G. P. Putnam's Sons. $\$ 8.95$.

## Fy ROBERT ORNSTEEIN

The scientific study of parapsychology has been with us for almost a century now, with little in the way of definitive results. One of the major problems in our acceptance of parapsychology, of course, is that we are quite resistant to new information and phenomena which we consider a priori to be impossible. We do not normally pursue scientific inquiry, for instance, into these areas. If I were to propose an experiment in training elephants to become peach trees a do not think much financial support would appear nor could I enlist anyone's enthusiastic help. People simply do not inform themselves about things they do not believe to be possible.
Such was the case within more conventional science with Copernicus's proposition of a universe that differed fundamentally from that of Ptolemy, with Harvey's discovery of the circulation of blood and even in the reporting of the Wright brothers' first air flight. Many newspapers, including The New York Times, simply refused to cover it because they did not think it was possible. In parapsychology, we ffind this rejection to an extreme, unmatched perhaps in any area. Even the great 19th-century German physiologist Hermann Helmholtz, distinguished in the areas of optics, physics and the study of perception wrote, "Neither the evidence of my own senses nor the testimony of all the fellows of the Royal Society" would convince him of the truth of parapsychological data. In a professional review. of the work of Russell Targ and Harold Puthoff, authors of "Mind-Reach," an unonymous reviewer in The Journal of Electrical. and Electronic Engineers wrote, "This is the kind of thing I wouldn't belleve in even if it were true."

One of the basic difficulties in understanding parapsychology is that its claims are a distinct challenge to our contemporaty world-view. If some people can percelve events before they "happen," if there are modes of interpersonal, communication unknown to

Robert Ornstein teaches at he University of Caliiornia Mcdical Apprave and is the director of Human Nature, a magazine to nppear in the fall.
many, if people can influence action and/or events at a distante greater than the range of nornal imfluence, then perlaps we need dramatically to revise our conception of human abilities and/or conception of how events are registered by people. Since the burden of documentation, though, should be on those who claim that these capacities exist, their interpretations of the nature of their data should be accepted only after much evidence has been accuniulated.

There seems to be a persistent fallacy regarding the work of parapsychologists that is based on a misunderstanding of the nature of scientific proof-an assumption that one demonstration, one example of a unique phenomenon should be enough to convince us that parapsychological or any other sort of scientific phenomena exist. William James expressed this proposition when he said that the appearance of only one white crow would dispel forever the idea that all crows are black. But that is true only in an extremely idealistic universe. We need much more evidence than one isolated instance to overthrow an acsepted world-view. The existence of William James's white crow could well be dismissed by our statistics department as statistically insignificant. One bit of evidence ought to be enough but it is not.
"Every man is an exception," as Soren Kirkegaard wrote. We are all 4 billion-to-one shots and, as scientists, need much more than occasional longshots to convince us.

Many publicizers of parapsychology have sought to counter their skeptics by Proclamation. They claim-and Targ and Puthoff are no exceptionthat there is a significant amount of incontrovertible scientific evidence in favor of the existence of parapsychological phenomena. And the only reason these phenomena are not more widely accepted is because of hostile prejudices, hecause of preconceptions in the minds of readers and reviewers, and because of blindness.
"Mind-Reach" fairly stralghtforwardly describes the experiments carried out at the Stanford Research Institute in Menlo Park, Calif., on socalled paranormal phenomena by Targ and Puthoff, who are physicists. The authors outline several of their own experiments in the book: One of these experiments involved "remote viewing," in which a person sequestered in a room is asked to describe a place chosen at random and not revealed to the subject, where two other people have gone. These descriptions are then matched with "objective" descriptions
 which people were asked to guess a

This document is made available through the declassification efforts and research of John Greenewald, Jr., creator of:

## The Black Vauit



The Black Vault is the largest online Freedom of Information Act (FOIA) document clearinghouse in the world. The research efforts here are responsible for the declassification of hundreds of thousands of pages released by the U.S. Government \& Military.

Discover the Truth at: httpi/www.theblackvault.com


March 7, 1977
Mr. Harvey Shapiro, Faitor
The Men York Times Book Review 229 west 43 rd Street
New York, New York, 10036

where
Robert Crnstein in his review of our book Mind-Reach in the March l 3 th Rok Review implies that our experiments in Remote Viewing, the main concern of the book, lack, solidity", and 4 cannot te repeated by anyone.

This is si mol v not true.
Cur experiments in Remote Viewing have keen widely replicated in hal $f$ a dozen laboratories across the country. Three of these were put Dished in the Proceedings of the Electrical and Electronic Encfnears (October 1976) - a journal Ornstein refers to - and a fourth Mas presented at the AיIfust 1976 annual meeting of the parapsychological Association, all well in advance of the look's review.

 4xymxy For Ornstein to state that there has been no replication is an inexcusable faux pas for a scientist supposedly knowledgeable

## in the fired he is reviewing.



## Our experiments at Stanford Research. Institute arc amon f the most

 severely monitored in the history of science. Li terally dozens of qualificd consultants and judges were involved ingereatinc,and evaluating the results described in the book. The evidence acoumulated was solid enough to impress some of science's most responsible authorities, including Dr. Margaret Mead, who wrote the Intro We are aware that Mind-beach delves into a subject sensitive in science, thy the case ot his review, it turned out to he so mibending, that severn tosic facts normal my noted in any diligent critique were missing: that the book is Illustrated (with 48 drawines and nhotographs), that it includes the Mead introduction and foreword ry Richard Each. You even "rave it to the wrong publisher Mind-Paach was published, wi th pride we are assured, by jelacorte Pross/ficanor friede, not bythe,purlisher you credited. The the ty


## Stanford Research Institute

 Menlo Park, Cali Cornea

# THE GITY COLLEGE <br> or <br> <br> THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK <br> <br> THE CITY UNIVERSITY OF NEW YORK NEW YORK, N. Y. 10031 

January 1, 197'

## DEPARTMFNT OF PSYCIIOLOGY

Dear liussell and fol:
Happy ew Year! And many thanks for arranging to have me sent a copy of your book!

I consratulate you on it. It's beautifully written, in such an easy style that I couldn't stop it once it was berun -- finished it in a single sitting. And it presents impressively so much that's importarit and interesting, that the content is a pleasure as well as the style. I should think it would bowl over the readers who didn't know about your work beforehand -- and am sure that parapsycholocists will be grateful for it, because it puts all together in one place the corpus of work you've done.

The timing was particularly good for me. It came the same day as the zalleyfs for my ms. for Wolman's Handbook, and I revised them to give two citations to the bokk.
'Thanks arain, and hopes that you'll carry on with all your bright ideas for what needs dofinc!

Cordially,



Targ, Russell \& Harold Puthoff MIND-REACH: Scientists Look at Psychic Ability Delacorte $\$ 8.95$
1/? SBN: 440-05688-7

Superficially it would seem that physicists and engineers would be the least likely supporters of extrasensory phenomena. But here we have two physicists at the distinguished Stanford Research Institute who have been doing rigorous experiments and conclude that There is Something There and it is something that probably exists in everyman. That something is remote viewing: the ability of a subject at $X$ to describe in words or drawings the details of a locale chosen by an experimenter miles away. They report on a number of experienced subjects, including Uri Geller. as well as some willing voluntecrs. All did better than chance would predict-even better in terms of drawings alone rather than verbal descriptions. Targ and Puthoff speculate that there may be some right hemisphere perceptual ability here that has gone unnoticed or shoved under the table in our rationalist analytic era. They also suggest that extremely low frequency electromagnetic waves may be involved, so that the phenomena need not remain beyond scientific ken. There is something very likeable about the pair: their attitude; their sophistication with regard to True Believers, to the possibilities of fraud and deception; and their understanding of the "loyal opposition" (e.g., Martin Gardner and others who wouldn't believe in ESP even if it were true). Margaret Mead has written an encouraging introduction showing she's ready to move with a shifting paradigm. Others, up to this point unconvinced, may be shaken up a bit (experience "cognitive dissonance" as the psychologists say). In any case, the results reported, confined to a small sample but with decent rigor, lob the ball squarely in the court of the nay-sayers. It will be interesting to watch the play that follows.


Recommended by the beooklist
MADELEINE L'ENGIE'S NEW BOOK,

## The Irrational Seasont

"I. Fugle's spiritual exerenech oner a year of seasonal chances and the Christian rhurch talendat are shared in there rellections trom hee presonal fournal. As the ditthors belieds intorm evervdiwion. trustrations, and combla 1 , thenge
 herself, mankind, and hel baith."--ALA, The Booblime
"... The most compeling pats on this sencitive bouk deventhe the muthor's periods of atheinerl and her tight to recover frotn whel isolation, the terror on braten ing in nothing." --Publishers Weakly


## Reconmended by libua leurmal JOHN COCIEY'S AUTOBIOGRAPHY

## A Canterbury Tale



 columbint ten the (atheder watel.
 the mose turbulent promed, in ent Hation's meliginus hestors... ha.


 ther beet sellse ot that trem. colerful. interontint, dal full al incuphta."-libriey kurnal
 Book keviow






av the destimation of a thired paty. The reseachers competent experimental technique and impeccable integrity combined with the obviously pasitive results of their experiments. provide unquestionably powerful evidence for the reality of parasensory perception. Targ and Puthoff demonstrate with this work thall given proper condilions. anyone can obtain perceptions traditionatly considered paranombal or imporsible. In addition. they prove the ficiliof of a positive setting for paramomal aclivity, and they demonstate akion and again the interference of the conscious mind with parapercention: only when confidence was inspired and analytical aclivity whpressed ar ipmoted.
 and Publode de more han prescon hatio matory observations. They descrite lie lncanny elusiveness of paychic phe-
 desipn condrolled experimens wos firmstated by amexpected, seemmely miraculous coincidences. Yel though the most convincing events took place outside the experiments, the anthons comsistemly regarded only commolled experimental resulls as valid scienitic data. Their book is highly recommend ed.-Linard H. Rassell, New bork

## Religior

 Comaty, Jom. The Iflorew King Montow. 1977. If,kp, illas, marn, inder if 76
 This well-written introduction to the Hebrew kings spans the peried hetween the election of Satll (c). |llon 13.(.) and the fall of Jermatem in the Bahylomians (c. 587 13.(.). The tex inclades: a hord eection datine with the atuborvhip of the Bille and a dix cossion of the nature of prophecs. Jion usefal are maps of the Holy 1 amd illmWating wibal and enemy homelation: a chronology of kings, prophels, and general history: Wach-and-white reproductiom of everal hivoric wonk of:at de picting the kings: and phologlaplos of serefal of the arehacolngical biter poesently known to be related to bilvitial places of intered. (omaty han written other hook of dewinh inerest bamons: llemo Tha Tamide of Krmable'm. 1.111

 This sheri lex wombl be wixdul in te lipioms achook and in lis colla's

 Reswere lmin.. Clowemal
al Ghamali. On the Duties of Rrother. howd.




HI
 mont importam theologiam, I In comimal Revitalization of the Redipum hit ancer was a compehemsive, fumdimen
al on beme: "hr hrother"." pinmal
and paterial "heeper": lolts adead ca. puent in down-an-arth fiahion in guid the reacer in his dans life. Al(;hat filis lacid usle and the readatle tran-fation rember the contents accossible despite difficult passages. How ever the entire Revitaliataion is available for $\$ 12$, from Books on Lham.
 (The hame company's Catalogute and Giutint to Boohs on M Mam. 6xp.. $\$ 1.50$. in " fich Revitaliataion is listed. is a fulls and thoughtfulls annotated, widerangidge extremely useful hater catake and 6bliography which every collection bin Wlam should have on is whelv fa.) …darid W. limleficld. Li-

Internh. Symposinm on the Holncams. athedral of St John the Divine. 1974. Auschwitz: beginning of a new cra: rffections on the halocalms.


\$8.95. 18 CLRL Nearlh thee vears aghentron and

 Alial inf anational ymposimin mate up
 fundanfendityention rancel hy the or gamish murder of sia million Jews an evil "f wich unprecedented magnituke that ine world prefer to forget it. Ap. proakfing the chatlenge from atome suvperapective, it in plain that newher an cary hope now an cimy lath in porshate any longer. lom Jes on Chmation. Suaccurbmed have we hecome wsolence since Auschwith that mbilferme is again the common tevpube. I his is mal a bato for the candall reader. hat it is imbinpensable to ans acring viment af Holocilus hivans. He boicen rased are often at odds, hat thes bear witners (1) "the chicf enmater-tevimon: of the
 new of esery human heing." - Valtum Malrar. Nom Sonh

OConmor. lilizateth. Ihe hew Communitı.

 ${ }^{8} 1$ OCommer hat writen a thengh-por whing hook on the vation anpera of ( hristam commonits as it is liseal in her (hurch of the Saciant (Wiahmetom




 :whld - thomeh tomme the thesele the oppencolt be powtare detwor, while aroidme both racrom amd cont
 commumbate and on the wothor oll 1 (ised a chlderl. Smathe for olamshand


 the status if women in the old Tentame'll.

jects-pulitics, chamity, atts. (in lo nesses for : main ensed in it Sumeth
 and leam all hin fee-ind so on. This might have heen a pmatical manual in the go-go conglomerate yeare of the | Yros, but today it's whimby. |Jammery)

## MORTAL LESSONS:

Notes on the Art of Surgery. Richard Sclacr. Simon and Schuster, $\$ 7.95$ ISBN (0-671-22.35(6-9
In this strange and remarkible book, Richard Selzer, a surgeon at Yale Medicall Center, juxtaposes reflection wilh information, anatomy with literature, horror with humor and surgery with poetry (just occasionally marred by whimsy) all in language that's as sharp as a scalpel. He takes us into the operating room and into the patient's very innards: alks beguilingly about bones. liver, kidneys. skin and other parts of the body (shipping those much-touted orgalm the brain and the hearls: and provides essays on baldness, smoking, Chinese acopuncture and abortion, as wall as some lighter pieces on his youth in Troy, New York. He ends, not as inappropriately as migh seem, with a charming piece on birdwatching. Even Selfers gristient anecdotes are transformed in the telling by his belief that the surgeon's function overlaps those of the poet and the priest. Otd drawings.
|Jannary|

## BA.AE, PRIVATE EYE:

The Real Wordd of the Private Detective. Nicholrs Pilesesi. Payboy Press. \$8.48 ISBN (1-87223-475-4
This stice of life is an honest piorture of What a private detective sorath is all about: it is revealing and lascinaling. Ifwin Blye has heen a privalce investigator for 20 years in and aromed New Yook. and he is a goos one. His joh consish not of chatsing Mallere falcons for sesy blondes, but of helping lawyers shepherd people through a system that is hureatucrazed. hungling and indifferem. Here we follow him as he works on three catses: looking up wit-

ascertain her hus mads income in case there is a disores, and working on an instance of a lamdiow a negligence. The rape case has an worme, but the other two tail ofr, kenme kome ends. It all has the ring ol truth and Pilegei does an admirable job of telling the story.
[./annay]

## THE CHRYSANTHEMUM

AND THE BAT: Baseball Samurai Style. Rohert Whiting. Dodd, Mead, \$i0 ISBN (0.396-07317-4
American baseball fans will find this book irresistible. Whiting has done an outstinding job of showing how the Japanese national chamacter has shaped the diamond game in that country. In spring taining, plagers are put through a regimen that would make a chain gang seem like a vacation. Throughout the 130-game season the two six-team major leagues demand from their team members a combination of "fighting spirit" (which does not include ageressive bascrumang or beanball pilches) and uaditional respect for juthority figures dapologies to conchis, managers and fans are commonpates. Besuboru is truly the dapolnese national game. with severab laily papers devoted exclusively.mo it and the TV networks satumbed with it. Of coume the mation logks forward to the diay of victory gice the U.S. in a true Word Serics. Photos.
[Jumurary

## MIND-REACH: Scientists

Look at P'sychic Ability. Russell Targ and Marold Pathoff. Delaconte Prens (An Elemor Friede Book), $\$ 8.95$ ISBN (0-440-0.5688-7
In a no-nonsense report to which Margare Mead has lent her scientific imprimatur with a brief introduction. physicists Targ and Puthoff describe a series of parapsychology experiments as dramatic as any ever undertaken. That these experiments, conducted at Stanford Researeh Institute, have generated much publicity is partly due to the participation of paychic wizards Uri Geller and Ingo Swimn. Yet most of the participants were ordinary people who were presumably able to accurately describe "larget drawings" hidden from view as well. as distimt geographical sites. The authors furnish transeripts of the experiments, hints for would-be "remote viewers" and one or two new hypotheses. Most striking are the photographs of the "targets" juxtaposed with the volunters's sketches so that readers can form their own opinion. Index, etc.
[January]

## THE IRRATIONAL SEASON.

Madelcine L'Engle. Crossroads/Seahury Press, $\$ 8.95$ ISBN 0-8164-032.4-4 ll's hard to imagine readers tailing to
women's movement, the book is especially valuable, for it's an exploration of L'Engle's life as a professional woman, wife, mother and grandmother. Combining anecdoles, poetry and a discussion of human relationships, the text is infused with feelings humorous and sad-sometimes tragic. Mostly the author reaffirms her commitment to Christianity, a faith which has frequently been weakened by doubts for solid reisons, not all personal. In fact, the most cumpelling parts of this sensitive book describe the author's periods of atheism and her fight to recover from "cold isolation," the terror of believing in nothing. Seghury's Lenten selection for 1977.
[Jamury]

HONEY: The Life
and Loves of Lenny's Shady Lady. Honey Brace with Dana Benenson. Playboy Press, $\$ 8.95$ ISIBN 0-87223-435-3
Most readers won't know whether to applaud the candor of this "true confession" of the woman who was Lenny Bruce's wife or be turned off by its emphasis on matters sexual with every $i$ dotted and every $i$ crossed. Those whom it does not affect violently one way or the other will find it the story of a lower midelle-class girl who became a stripper, thought she had found love in a lesbian affair and then met and married the rising young comedian who later became so controversial. The sections dealing with Honcy's show business catcer are so jejune that they sound like parody; the passages dealing with Lenny and their stormy, drugobsessed life together are always interesting and at times absorhing. Most alfecting is the picture of Bruce after his busts for obscenity had started-a paranoid, monomaniacal, frenetic wreck.
[January]

## WTTH MALICE TOWARD NONE:

The Life of Abraham Lincoln. Stephen B. Outes. Harper \& Row, $\$ 15.95$ ISBN (0-0)6-013283-3
The blurb for Oates's highly readable, dramatic life of President Lincoln suggests that it's an expose of the "real" Lincoln which emphasizes his disdain for parental background. lust for political power, elc. Such points are made only Ilectingly as the atuthor is swept along by the tide of epic events which tried and tested Lincoln and bore him to glory. This book has the appeal of a good novel with no distracting footnotes. But it's clear from an appendage of notes at the end that Oates has studied all sources-the flood of biographies and memoirs on the Civil War president with which his book will be inevitably compared. Oates has done an admirable job with this portrayal of


Newsweek
From
CHARLES PANATI

Dear Hal and Russ,
I just finished your book and think it is wonderful. Beautifully done.

I'm filled with curiosity to see how it is received--what with the impressive data, the sober presentation, the introduction by Margaret Mead, everything-I particularly liked the chapter on the "Loyal Opposition." You put the facts straight and put everyone in his place-all the while be level-headed and gentlemanly (more that can be said for the Loyal Opposition).

Thank you for mentioning the Geller Papers. I regard it an honor to have my name in your book. I wish you more than luck, you both deserve it.

Best wishes for the New Year,

ne movernent, some institu. $\therefore$ 二wed by those excluded from rident, enlightened, sensiAppo
ciass liberalism, like that susand controlling this book, has en as nothing less than a moveor institution-perhaps a comnovement at that.
he point of largest substance restorations is the thing posicded, present now, absent be:at which forces, by its starresence, a reconsideration of ind where you are. In letters an authority that depends aitoupon inwardness with the character of the times, that can without winking, say-as a curfashionable novel speaks-of as "the most profound moral of our time." There's another ity derived from an instinct for tioning; in its books, regardless times, sanity is a ruke not an and shamelessness invariably ned shame. "Responses" recov" 1 outline of the latter kind of ity, and it is, to repeat, a cleansrht.
in 1911 (at the age of 48) when nsformed the literal Alexandrian ; of his poems into a "metaphor"
"" Keeley traces the evolution poet's mythic model through gressive stages as "sensual city" mythical Alexandria," which in expands to embrace the entire 1 of Hellenism"; from there the inally attains a: "universal per" ie." Fortunately, Keeley underthat what the critic reads as sal qualities are less than conly wrought by poets, and his hapter shows how the detached vision of some of the late poems springs out of, is possibie only ie of, the poet's meticulous and nt working-out of his personal al structure. The complex and and integrity of Cavafy's model, -st produced by a modern poet, ealed by the demonstration of $2 t$ that each of its phases is subin its successors. Thus Keeley Ey shows how the eroticism of eems of the "sonsual city" not -xists on the two planes of the it and modern worlds where jaralleism dernotes the continui* a hedonistic ethic and the radicalerent social status of its practi3 , but that it also joins with his major themes to contribute to f's final vision of the human - n under the aspect of sternity. lebrate it still for the passions
affirmed, or evon 'onscread, but arere-
Iy set aside as an unreliable judige of
 While each of "The Mind Field" cri-tiques-oi secret Gurdjieff groups, mystical sport centers, Carlos Castaneda, Uri Geller-is sensible, the continual scolding tone becomes umpleasant. The sighs of dismay. breathing throughout this book collect into a whine. Eventually Professor Ornstein presents his choice of an esoteric psychology for all seasons: contemporary Sufism. "The Mind Field's" final section is a guided reading of 11 Sufi tales selected from the recent anthologies of Indries Shah.

Yet for all Professor Orastein's talk about intuitive wholistic understanding, his map of the mind field is surprisingly flat: it lacks any political dimension. He never considers that there could be reasons particular to America why our psychological explorations become desperate personal quests or become reified into "consciousness" for conspicuous consumption. The frustrated yearnings for community behind such quests are never examined. Ornstein writes: "It is an unfortunate acciderst of the 20th-century that those most interested in personal knowleglge and in an extended conception of man tend to be those least suited to gaining or using them." An unfortumate accident? Instead of analyzing why we produce timid professionals on the one hand and umprincipled quacks on the other, Professor Ormstein seems content to scold.

On the West Coust at least, Robert Ormstein is justly well-known for experiments which show that intuition or "right brain thinking" probably has a physiological basis. Eecause he is a respectable-scientist he has been looked to by many as a consciouspess expert. "The Mind Field" seems born out of too many lecture tours, too many dimers and symposia and parties full of curious strangers. It is as if, having been asked the same grand questions too ofter, Professor. Ornstein finally lost his temper and said: "All right, you want to know what I think of atl these damn move ments, well let me tell you. . ..".

How-not-to guides rarely help beginners. Those readers who are just now becoming curious about Yoga, Zan, biofecibaci, parapsyctology and the like wouid be berter off turning to Ornstein's earlier book, "The Psycholegy of Consciousness." It is a com-" prebensive and often graceful introduction to esoteric psychology. Those readers who already appreciate the esoteric tradition will have to bok beyond "The Mind Field" for mature



